JURNAL ILMIAH GURU MADRASAH (JIGM)
Volume 5, Issue 1, January-June 2026
10.69548/jigm.v5i1.112

Conceptual Analysis of the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) Model in Islamic Religious Education Learning

[*]Fathinah Mufidah[1], Nia Wardhani[2], Yusnaini[3]
[1,2,3]Universitas Islam Negeri Sultanah Nahrasiyah, Lhokseumawe, Indonesia
[*]Email: fathinah.mufidah@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study aims to provide a conceptual analysis of the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) learning model in the context of Islamic Religious Education (IRE). The method employed is a literature review using a conceptual analysis approach of relevant sources, including books, academic journals, and previous research findings. The analysis focuses on the theoretical foundations, characteristics, implementation procedures, as well as the strengths and limitations of the STAD model in IRE learning. The findings indicate that the STAD model has significant potential to enhance student engagement, promote collaborative learning, and improve understanding of religious concepts through constructive social interaction. Furthermore, the implementation of STAD aligns with Islamic values such as cooperation (ta'awun) and togetherness. However, its effectiveness largely depends on teacher readiness, classroom management, and student characteristics. Therefore, appropriate implementation strategies are required to optimize the use of the STAD model in Islamic Religious Education.

Keywords: *STAD, Cooperative Learning, Islamic Religious Education, Conceptual Analysis, Learning Strategies*

***

A. INTRODUCTION

The learning process is a fundamental activity in education aimed at helping students understand their surrounding environment through organized experiences. This process is not merely about absorbing information, but also involves behavioral transformation encompassing cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. In this context, learning serves as an essential medium for shaping students' character, insights, and skills that are applicable in real-life situations. (Asnawi et al., 2020)

The primary objective of learning is to foster positive behavioral changes in students, including improvements in knowledge, attitudes, and skills. This transformation is achieved through systematic and meaningful learning experiences. Therefore, the selection of appropriate instructional methods becomes a crucial factor in creating an effective and engaging learning environment. Teachers are required to adapt their teaching strategies to align with students' characteristics and the subject matter being taught.

Islamic Religious Education (PAI) plays a significant role in instilling moral and spiritual values in students. It is not limited to the delivery of theoretical knowledge about Islamic teachings but also functions as a medium for character development. Core values such as honesty, responsibility, tolerance, and compassion must be instilled from an early age through appropriate pedagogical approaches. (Asnawi et al., 2020)

In addition to cognitive development, PAI aims to address the affective dimension of students. Education that focuses solely on knowledge without integrating attitudes and behaviors risks losing its deeper meaning. Therefore, learning approaches that integrate intellectual and emotional dimensions are highly necessary. This requires instructional models capable of bridging theoretical understanding with real-life application.

One instructional approach that is frequently discussed in the literature is the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) model. STAD is a cooperative learning model that emphasizes collaboration within small, heterogeneous groups. In this model, students work together to understand learning materials, support each other, and are individually evaluated to measure their level of comprehension. (Abidin, 2023)

From a conceptual perspective, the STAD model provides opportunities for active peer interaction, strengthens both individual and group responsibility, and promotes a sense of collective achievement. It also contributes to the development of social values such as empathy, cooperation, and mutual support among group members. A distinctive feature of STAD lies in its group-based evaluation system, which encourages students to be responsible not only for their own learning outcomes but also for the success of their team. (Primartadi, 2013)

Previous studies have reported that the implementation of the STAD model can enhance students' motivation and understanding of learning materials, including in Islamic Religious Education contexts. However, it is important to emphasize that these findings are derived from prior empirical research, not from primary data collected in this study. Therefore, this article positions these claims as part of a broader body of literature that highlights the potential effectiveness of STAD in fostering active, meaningful, and student-centered learning environments.

Despite its potential, the implementation of the STAD model also presents several challenges, as identified in previous studies. These include teachers' limited understanding of the model's technical procedures, time constraints within classroom schedules, and differences in students' abilities that may affect group dynamics and learning outcomes. Addressing these challenges requires adequate teacher training and continuous professional support to ensure effective and sustainable implementation. (Puspita et al., 2023).

This study adopts a literature-based (conceptual) approach to analyze the STAD model within the context of Islamic Religious Education learning. The analysis is conducted by reviewing and synthesizing relevant scholarly works, focusing on the conceptual foundations, implementation procedures, advantages, and limitations of the model. Through this approach, the study aims to provide a clearer theoretical understanding and to identify gaps or challenges in its application.

Furthermore, this conceptual analysis seeks to highlight the relevance of the STAD model in PAI learning by critically examining its alignment with the objectives of Islamic education, particularly in integrating cognitive, affective, and social dimensions. By synthesizing findings from previous studies, this article contributes to the development of more contextual and applicable instructional strategies. Ultimately, learning is expected to function not only as a means of knowledge transfer but also as a process for nurturing morally grounded, intellectually capable, and socially responsible individuals. (PRADEVI et al., 2021).

B. METHOD

This study employs a qualitative approach using a library research design, focusing on a conceptual analysis of the Student Teams Achievement Divisions (STAD) cooperative learning model in the context of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) learning. This approach is selected as the study aims to examine, review, and synthesize theoretical concepts and findings from previous studies rather than conducting empirical field research. (Asnawi et al., 2020)

The data sources are derived from relevant academic literature, including textbooks, national and international journal articles, undergraduate theses, dissertations, and curriculum documents related to Islamic Religious Education. The selection of sources is conducted purposively based on the following criteria: (1) direct relevance to the STAD learning model, (2) discussion of cooperative learning implementation or effectiveness within educational contexts, and (3) publication in credible academic sources. (Widyastono, 2007).

Data collection is carried out through documentation techniques by identifying, classifying, and organizing literature aligned with the research focus. The data are then analyzed using content analysis techniques involving several stages: (1) data reduction through the selection of relevant information, (2) thematic categorization covering the fundamental concepts of STAD, implementation procedures, strengths and limitations, and its relevance to IRE learning, and (3) synthesis and interpretation to develop a comprehensive and critical understanding. (Primartadi, 2013). To ensure data validity, this study applies source triangulation by comparing various theoretical perspectives and findings from previous studies. Therefore, claims regarding the effectiveness of the STAD model in improving student engagement and learning outcomes in this study are not based on primary empirical data but are derived from the synthesis of prior research findings. Through this approach, the study is expected to provide a theoretical contribution in the form of a deeper conceptual analysis of the STAD model in Islamic Religious Education learning, while also highlighting its relevance and potential in fostering collaborative, interactive, and achievement-oriented learning processes.

C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Concept and Mechanism of the STAD Model

The Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) model is one of the

cooperative learning approaches developed by Robert E. Slavin from Johns Hopkins University. Conceptually, STAD emerged as a response to the need for instructional models that not only emphasize individual academic achievement but also foster social skills, teamwork, and positive interdependence among students. Within the context of Islamic Religious Education (IRE), this model is particularly relevant as it aligns with values such as cooperation (*ta'awun*), mutual respect, and collective responsibility. STAD emphasizes the active involvement of students in the learning process as members of a team working toward shared academic goals, (Hamruni, 2009).

From a conceptual perspective, STAD is grounded in the principles of cooperative learning that prioritize interaction among group members with heterogeneous compositions. Each team member is responsible not only for mastering the learning material but also for assisting peers in achieving similar understanding. This principle creates a more democratic and egalitarian learning environment, where the success of one student contributes to the success of the entire group.

Based on a review of previous studies, the primary objective of implementing STAD is to improve students' academic achievement while simultaneously developing social skills such as communication, leadership, and empathy. In addition, STAD is designed to enhance students' motivation and sense of responsibility, as individual contributions directly affect team performance. Several studies have also highlighted that this model implicitly integrates moral values such as cooperation, discipline, and honesty within the learning process. (Asnawi et al., 2020) It should be noted that these claims are derived from prior empirical research rather than findings from the present study.

Conceptually, the implementation of STAD consists of several systematic stages. The first stage is class presentation, where the teacher delivers the core material to the entire class. In this phase, the teacher provides structured explanations to establish a common foundation of understanding. This stage is crucial because students' comprehension will later influence both their team discussions and individual performance.

The second stage is teamwork, where students are organized into small groups of four to five members with diverse academic abilities. During this phase, students engage in discussions, solve problems collaboratively, and explain concepts to one another. Literature suggests that this interaction plays a significant role in reinforcing understanding and promoting peer-assisted learning. Furthermore, the collaborative atmosphere nurtures solidarity and empathy among students.

The third stage involves individual quizzes, where students complete assessments independently without assistance from their teammates. This stage is intended to measure each student's personal understanding of the material. In the context of conceptual analysis, this mechanism reflects the balance between cooperative processes and individual accountability, which is a key characteristic of the STAD model.

The fourth stage is individual improvement scoring, where students' performance is evaluated based on their progress compared to previous baseline scores. This scoring system provides equal opportunities for all students, including those with lower academic

performance, to contribute meaningfully to their team by demonstrating improvement. Previous studies have shown that this approach encourages continuous progress rather than mere competition for high scores. (Firmansyah Simanjuntak et al., 2024). The final stage is team recognition, where groups with the highest average improvement receive rewards. These rewards may take various forms, such as verbal praise, certificates, additional points, or public recognition. Conceptually, this stage functions as a motivational strategy that fosters healthy competition and strengthens group cohesion.

From a conceptual standpoint, STAD can be understood as a comprehensive learning model that integrates cognitive, affective, and social dimensions simultaneously. Its structured mechanism is not merely aimed at knowledge transfer but also at character development through interaction, evaluation, and collaboration. In the context of Islamic Religious Education, this model holds particular relevance because it supports the internalization of moral and social values alongside academic learning. However, based on the literature reviewed, further critical analysis is needed to assess its contextual effectiveness, especially in relation to the specific characteristics of IRE learning environments. (Odilia Juana Soares et al., 2025)

2. Effective Application in Islamic Religious Education Learning (PAI)

Within the framework of a conceptual analysis, the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) model is widely discussed in the literature as a cooperative learning approach that has the potential to foster effective collaboration among students. Various studies indicate that heterogeneous grouping allows learners to develop mutual respect, enhance communication skills, and engage in collective problem-solving processes. These interactions are not only associated with improved academic understanding but are also linked to the development of social competencies such as empathy, tolerance, and the ability to express ideas constructively. (Suwondo, 2023)

From a theoretical perspective, STAD emphasizes individual accountability within a collaborative structure. Although students work in teams, each member remains responsible for mastering the learning material. This dual emphasis individual responsibility and group interdependence is frequently highlighted in prior research as a key factor in promoting both academic seriousness and a sense of collective commitment. Such a structure is considered relevant to the values embedded in Islamic Religious Education (PAI), particularly those related to cooperation (*ta'awun*) and shared responsibility.

The literature also suggests that STAD facilitates active learning through structured activities such as group discussions, collaborative problem-solving, and individual quizzes. In this context, students are positioned not merely as passive recipients of knowledge but as active participants who construct understanding and articulate concepts to peers. This process is argued to contribute to the development of independence, initiative, and critical thinking skills. (Andri Valen & Sukenda Egok, 2020).

Furthermore, several studies report that cooperative settings like STAD can

provide opportunities for students who are typically passive in conventional classrooms to become more engaged. The supportive team environment encourages them to express opinions, ask questions, and participate in explaining concepts. This condition is frequently associated with increased self-confidence, particularly among students with lower academic self-efficacy.

Another important aspect highlighted in the literature is the integration of cooperation and healthy competition within the STAD model. While groups compete to achieve the highest scores, collaboration within teams remains central. This balance is often described as creating a motivating and enjoyable learning environment that encourages students to improve performance without undermining others. However, a critical review of the literature also reveals several limitations of the STAD model. One commonly identified challenge is the relatively high time demand required for its implementation. The sequence of instructional activities presentation, group discussion, individual assessment, and scoring tends to require more time compared to conventional teaching methods. This constraint may pose difficulties in contexts where instructional time is limited by curriculum demands.

In addition, the effectiveness of STAD is closely tied to the teacher's classroom management skills. Without proper guidance and monitoring, group activities may become unfocused, overly noisy, or dominated by certain students. Therefore, the literature emphasizes the importance of clear instructions, effective time management, and continuous teacher supervision to ensure that learning objectives are achieved. (Rompegading et al., 2021)

Another limitation identified is the potential for unequal participation within groups. Some students may rely excessively on more active or academically stronger peers, which can hinder the development of individual understanding. This issue highlights the need for careful monitoring of individual contributions and the use of appropriate strategies to ensure balanced participation among group members.

Finally, the literature suggests that STAD is more effectively applied to conceptual learning materials that require deep understanding and active discussion. For topics that are procedural, memorization-based, or practice-oriented, the model may be less optimal. Therefore, the selection of instructional content becomes a critical factor in determining the effectiveness of STAD implementation. (Pujiono, 2017) Overall, this conceptual analysis demonstrates that while the STAD model offers significant pedagogical potential in Islamic Religious Education, its effectiveness is highly dependent on contextual factors, instructional design, and teacher competence. Hence, its application should be critically adapted to align with the characteristics of the subject matter and learning objectives.

3. Effective Implementation in Islamic Religious Education Learning

Within the framework of a conceptual and literature-based analysis, the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) model is considered highly relevant for implementation in Islamic Religious Education (IRE/PAI). This relevance is supported

by findings from previous studies which indicate that STAD not only enhances cognitive achievement but also contributes to the development of affective and spiritual dimensions of learners. (Puspitasari, 2021) In the context of Islamic education, learning is not limited to theoretical understanding but extends to the internalization and practical application of religious values in daily life. Therefore, cooperative learning approaches such as STAD provide a meaningful and interactive learning environment that aligns with these objectives.

Based on the literature, STAD facilitates collaborative exploration of Islamic values such as honesty (ṣidq), responsibility, trustworthiness (amanah), and Islamic brotherhood (ukhuwah Islamiyah). Previous studies have shown that group-based discussions enable students to interpret religious concepts more deeply, connect them with Qur'anic verses and Hadith, and contextualize them in real-life situations. This process strengthens both conceptual understanding and value internalization.

Conceptually, the implementation of STAD in IRE begins with a teacher-led presentation phase. At this stage, the teacher introduces key materials such as moral teachings (akhlaq), worship practices, or prophetic stories, often supported by references from the Qur'an and Hadith. Literature suggests that clear and structured presentation is crucial in establishing foundational knowledge that guides subsequent group discussions. (Yeknti, 2024) Without this clarity, collaborative activities may lose focus and effectiveness.

Following the presentation phase, students are organized into heterogeneous groups to engage in deeper discussion. For example, in learning about honesty, students may collaboratively analyze its application in school, family, and community contexts. Research findings indicate that such interactions promote critical thinking, communication skills, and mutual respect among learners. These outcomes highlight the social and pedagogical advantages of cooperative learning in religious education settings. The next stage involves individual quizzes designed to assess students' understanding after group discussions. Previous empirical studies emphasize that individual accountability is a key strength of STAD, ensuring that each student actively engages with the material rather than relying solely on group members. (Anggraini et al., 2018). In IRE, these assessments may include interpretation of religious texts, application of Islamic values, or conceptual understanding of teachings.

Another important component of STAD is the comparison of individual scores over time to measure learning progress. Conceptually, this aligns with the Islamic principle of *muḥāsabah* (self-evaluation), encouraging students to continuously reflect on and improve both their knowledge and behavior. Literature suggests that this system provides equal opportunities for all students, including those with lower initial performance, to contribute meaningfully to group success.

Group recognition is also an integral aspect of STAD. Studies have shown that rewards such as praise, certificates, or public acknowledgment can enhance student motivation and participation. In the context of IRE, this practice reinforces the Islamic value that effort and sincere intention are highly appreciated. Thus, the reward system in

STAD not only motivates learners academically but also carries moral and spiritual significance.

Furthermore, previous research consistently indicates that the implementation of STAD contributes to character development. Through sustained interaction within groups, students practice values such as patience, respect for differences, and responsibility. This supports the argument that cooperative learning transforms Islamic values from abstract concepts into lived experiences. (Alfiani & Sopiyani, 2014) However, based on a critical review of the literature, it is important to note that claims regarding the effectiveness of STAD in improving learning outcomes and engagement are derived from prior empirical studies rather than primary data in this study. Therefore, this article positions itself as a conceptual synthesis that highlights patterns, strengths, and relevance of STAD within IRE contexts, rather than providing direct experimental validation.

Overall, the STAD model can be conceptually understood as a holistic learning approach that integrates cognitive, affective, and social dimensions. By emphasizing collaboration, individual accountability, and reflective evaluation, STAD aligns closely with the objectives of Islamic Religious Education, which aim to develop individuals who are knowledgeable, morally grounded, and socially responsible. This conceptual analysis underscores the potential of STAD as a pedagogical framework that supports not only academic understanding but also the internalization and application of Islamic teachings in everyday life. (Muliani et al., 2021)

D. CONCLUSION

Based on the conceptual and literature-based analysis, the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) model can be understood as a cooperative learning approach that systematically integrates cognitive, social, and affective dimensions within the learning process. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (IRE/PAI), STAD demonstrates strong conceptual relevance as it aligns with fundamental Islamic values such as cooperation (*ta'awun*), responsibility, honesty, and mutual respect. Through its structured stages class presentation, teamwork, individual quizzes, individual improvement scoring, and team recognition STAD not only facilitates academic achievement but also supports the internalization of moral and spiritual values.

The analysis highlights that STAD promotes active student engagement, collaborative learning, and individual accountability, which are essential for meaningful learning in Islamic education. Additionally, the model provides opportunities for character development by transforming abstract religious values into practical experiences through group interaction and reflective evaluation. These aspects make STAD particularly suitable for learning materials that require deep understanding and contextual interpretation of Islamic teachings.

However, this study also acknowledges that the effectiveness of STAD is influenced by several contextual factors, including time allocation, teacher competence in classroom management, and the suitability of instructional materials. Challenges such

as unequal participation and the time-intensive nature of the model must be carefully managed to ensure optimal implementation. In conclusion, within the framework of the *Conceptual Analysis of the Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) Model in Islamic Religious Education Learning*, STAD can be regarded as a holistic and potentially effective pedagogical model. It not only enhances academic outcomes but also contributes to the development of students' character and social competencies. Nevertheless, its application requires thoughtful adaptation to the specific context of Islamic Religious Education to achieve its intended educational goals.

***

REFERENCES

Abidin, Z. (2023). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) terhadap Hasil Belajar Matematika Siswa. *Educatoria : Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, *3*(3), 202–207. https://doi.org/10.36312/educatoria.v3i3.199

Alfiani, D. A., & Sopiyani, S. (2014). PENGARUH MODEL PEMBELAJARAN COOPERATIVE LEARNING TIPE STUDENT TEAMS ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION (STAD) TERHADAP HASIL BELAJAR IPA SISWA KELAS V DI SD NEGERI 1 TERSANA KECAMATAN PABEDILAN KABUPATEN CIREBON. *Al Ibtida: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru MI*, *1*(1). https://doi.org/10.24235/al.ibtida.snj.v1i1.459

Andri Valen, & Sukenda Egok, A. (2020). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar IPS Melalui Model Student Team Achievement Division Siswa Kelas IV SD Negeri 82 Bengkulu. *INVENTA*, *4*(2), 181–189. https://doi.org/10.36456/inventa.4.2.a2593

Anggraini, D., Relmasira, S., & Tyas Asri Hardini, A. (2018). PENERAPAN MODEL PEMBELAJARAN STUDENT TEAMS ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION (STAD) MELALUI MEDIA PEMBELAJARAN ULAR TANGGA UNTUK MENINGKATKAN KEMAMPUAN BERPIKIR KRITIS DAN HASIL BELAJAR IPS PADA PESERTA DIDIK KELAS 2 SD. *Pendekar : Jurnal Pendidikan Berkarakter*, *1*(1), 324. https://doi.org/10.31764/pendekar.v1i1.379

Asnawi, A., M. Ikhsan, & Hajidin, H. (2020). PENGARUH MODEL KOOPERATIF TIPE STUDENT TEAMS ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION DAN TIPE JIGSAW TERHADAP PRESTASI DAN MOTIVASI BELAJAR SISWA SMP. *Numeracy*, *7*(1), 150–162. https://doi.org/10.46244/numeracy.v7i1.1039

Firmansyah Simanjuntak, Angin Jonatan A. D. P. Sinaga, & Sumardi Rivandi Sitohang. (2024). Meta Analisis Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) pada Mata Pelajaran Fisika terhadap Hasil Belajar

Siswa. *Algoritma : Jurnal Matematika, Ilmu Pengetahuan Alam, Kebumian Dan Angkasa*, *3*(1), 99–113. https://doi.org/10.62383/algoritma.v3i1.359

Hamruni. 2009. Strategi dan Model-Model Pembelajaran Aktif-Menyenangkan. Yogyakarta: Fakultas Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta.

Muliani, D. E., Lestari, O. P., & Deswita, N. (2021). TIPE STUDENT TEAMS ACHIEVEMENT DIVISIONS TERHADAP BELAJAR IPA DI KELAS V SD. *Jurnal Riset Pendidikan Dasar Dan Karakter*, *3*(2), 46–51.

Odilia Juana Soares, Wolfgang Asindo Seran, & Stefania Sonia Manek. (2025). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Team Assisted Individualization terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa. *SOSIAL : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan IPS*, *3*(4), 107–118. https://doi.org/10.62383/sosial.v3i4.1352

Pradevi, A. F., Susanti, M. M. I., & Rustamti, M. I. (2021). Meningkatkan Minat Belajar Dan Kreativitas Dengan Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) Siswa. *Teaching : Jurnal Inovasi Keguruan Dan Ilmu Pendidikan*, *1*(2), 87–92. https://doi.org/10.51878/teaching.v1i2.269

Primartadi, A. (2013). Pengaruh metode student teams-achievement division (STAD) dan problem based learning terhadap hasil belajar ditinjau dari potensi akademik siswa SMK otomotif. *Jurnal Pendidikan Vokasi*, *2*(2). https://doi.org/10.21831/jpv.v2i2.1024

Pujiono, R. (2017). PENERAPAN MODEL PEMBELAJARAN KOOPERATIF TIPE STUDENT TEAM ACHIEVEMENT DIVISIONS (STAD) UNTUK MENINGKATKAN MOTIVASI DAN HASIL BELAJAR IPA SISWA KELAS V B SDN 047 TARAKAN. *Journal of Education Research and Evaluation*, *1*(4), 198. https://doi.org/10.23887/jere.v1i4.11943

Puspita, A. D., Tilaar, A. L. F., & Salajang, S. M. (2023). PENGARUH MODEL PEMBELAJARAN KOOPERATIF TIPE STUDENT TEAM ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION TERHADAP HASIL BELAJAR SISTEM PERSAMAAN LINEAR DUA VARIABEL. *Jurnal Lebesgue : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Matematika, Matematika Dan Statistika*, *4*(3), 1929–1934. https://doi.org/10.46306/lb.v4i3.520

Puspitasari, C. (2021). *Skripsi Meta-Analisis Pengaruh Model kooperatif Tipe Student Team Achievement Division terhadap Hasil Belajar Peserta Didik Sekolah Dasar* https://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/handle/123456789/55394

Rompegading, A. B., Safitri, M., & Irfandi, R. (2021). Perbandingan Hasil Belajar Siswa antara Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Team Games Tournament dengan Student Teams Achievement Division. *BIOEDUSAINS:Jurnal Pendidikan Biologi Dan Sains*, *4*(2), 205–211. https://doi.org/10.31539/bioedusains.v4i2.2245

Suwondo, A. (2023). Apakah Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Student Teams Achivements Division (STAD) Masih Mampu Meningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa Sekolah

Menengah Atas? *Journal of Education Action Research*, *7*(1), 45–50. https://doi.org/10.23887/jear.v7i1.49862

Widyastono, H. (2007). METODOLOGI PENELITIAN ALAMIAH DAN ALAMIAH. Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan, 13(68), 757–775. https://doi.org/10.24832/jpnk.v13i68.398.

Yekti, C. S. H. (2024). *Analisis model pembelajaran kooperatif tipe Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) dalam mencegah perilaku kontraproduktif siswa*. Skripsi: Universitas Islam Sultan Agung.